INCIDENCE AND SIGNIFICANCE OF POLYNUCLEAR AROMATIC HYDROCARBONS IN THE WATER ENVIRONMENT

Authors:

Julian B. Andelman

John E. Snodgrass

Graduate School of Public Health

University of Pittsburgh

Pittsburgh, Pa.

Referes:

Samuel J. Faust
College of Agriculture and
Environmental Science
Rutgers University

New Brunswick, New Jersey



INTRODUCTION

It has been established that many polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbons (which will be referred to as PAH) are carcinogenic to animals and probably to man. This review will focus on their occurrence, significance in, and passage through the water environment, which represents a possible danger to man in terms of widespread exposure to PAH, Literature was reviewed for the years 1968 through the first half of 1973 as an updating of an earlier comprehensive review by Andelman and Suess, which covered the literature prior to 1968, and to which the reader should refer for additional information.

Most of the studies on the incidence of PAH in the water environment have been carried out in Europe. The most comprehensive investigations on the sources of PAH, their spread in the environment, and the efficacy of various treatment methods have been done by Borneff and his associates in the German Federal Republic. Soviet investigations, principally by Il'nitskii and Shabad, have concentrated on effluents from various manufacturers as one of the main sources of pollution of water bodies by PAH.

In a recent review article, Shabad and Il'nitskii² pointed out that, although the amount of PAH a man may consume from heavily polluted water is only about 0.1% of the amount he consumes in food, carcinogenic PAH from water can accumulate in various aquatic organisms, including fish, some mollusks, and edible algae. Water used for irrigation may also affect the level of carcinogenic PAH in vegetable foodstuffs.

The need to establish hygienic standards for carcinogenic compounds has been given more attention in the last few years. Shabad³ states that "without waiting for the complete elucidation of mechanisms of blastomogenesis or even the solution of the problem of the action threshold of carcinogens, everything should now be done to establish maximum permissible doses and concentrations of individual carcinogens, taking account of the nature and duration of contact with them. The PAH are the first priority." Similarly, the most recent edition of the World Health Organization European Standards for Drinking Water (1970)⁴ recommends that "for the safety of consumers, the concentration of PAH should not exceed 0.2 µg/1." It further recommends that there should be at least one center in each country

January 1974

69

carrying out investigations of PAH in ater, and that more research into their and importance in drinking water is The most recent (1962) United States alth Service standards for drinking water ention PAII. However, a recent publica-The National Institute of Environmental isk Forces states: "Some materials which terways are known to be carcinogenic to mals. Others may have physiological of which we are currently unaware. The contaminants should be identified and the igical significance of the concentrations in the environment determined. Also the significance of the heterogenous es as they exist in water should be icd."

The following review will deal with the pertinent physicochemical properties of PAH, their analysis, origin, source, and transport in the environment; their presence in environmental waters, their removal or destruction by various treatment processes, and the possible health consequences to man of PAH in the water environment. The emphasis will be on 3,4-benzpyrene, one of the most carcinogenic of the PAH.

PHYSICOCHEMICAL PROPERTIES AND ANALYSIS OF PAH

The chemical structures of two typical PAH are as follows:

Typical polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbons

3,4-benzpyrene

A-Benzpyrene (BP) is ubiquitous in the ronment and one of the most potent of the inogenic PAH. Consequently, it has been the studied. 1,2,5,6-Dibenzanthracene (DBA) has been identified as a very potent escinogen 1,2-benzanthracene (BA), 3,4-benzfluoranne (3,4-BF), 10,11-benzfluoranthene (1-BF), chrysene (CH), 9,10-dimethyl-1,2-tanthracene (DMBA), indeno (1,2,3-cd) pyrene 3-methylcholanthrene (MCA), and 1,2-typyrene (1,2-BP) have been shown to possess inogenic properties.

the two most important properties influencing incidence of PAH in water are their solubility stability. Their high molecular weight and lack polar substituent groups make them very luble in water. The solubility of BP in clean water or tap water was found to be approxically 0.01 µg/i.

Despite the low solubility of PAH, their sence in environmental waters can be increased the action of micelles formed by synthetic regents and by the action of other solubio

1.2.5.6-dibenzanthracene

organic compounds. The presence of surfactants in the range of 10 to 50 mg/l increases the solubility of BP from two to ten times. However, as noted by Andelman and Suess, the concentration of surfactants in natural and treated waters rarely teaches a high enough concentration to affect the solubility of BP. Surface active agents in the concentrations from 0.1 to 1.0 mg/l do not show any effect on BP solubility. Drinking water standards typically permit only 1.0 mg/l of surface active agents.

Phenol concentrations from 1 to 50 mg/l do not have any effect on BP solubility, but the addition of caffeine to water increases both the solubility and rate of BP going into solution, as the caffeine concentration is increased from 0.01 to 0.10 mol/l. in their review, Andelman and Suess noted that other studies showed that factic acid, acetone, and ethyl alcohol increase the solubility of BP in water. The possibility exists that other organic compounds present in polluted waters could also solubilize BP. Finally, highly polluted water containing emulsions of organic solvents

would be capable of containing relatively large amounts of BP. 1

Studies have also shown that BP can be sorbed and concentrated on activated carbon, calcareous material, silica, glass, and soil particles. The presence of these minerals and other suspended and settled particles in natural waters can also be sources of relatively high concentrations of BP.

BP can be very stable in water and renisin in solution over long periods of time. Il'nitskii et al. 7 performed experiments using pond and tap water with initial DP concentrations of 10 and 0.01 µg/l. The 10 µg/l solution is prepared by adding I mi of acetone solution containing 2 μ g of BP to a 250 ml flask, evaporating the acetone, adding 200 ml of tap or pond water, and mixing thoroughly. The 0.01 µg/l solution is prepared by adding 10 ml of acetone containing 0.01 µg/ml BP into a 10 l iar. filling the jar with pond or tap water, and mixing thoroughly. Both solutions are stored in the dark. After extracting the solutions with benzene, quantitative analysis is performed spectrofluorimetrically using Shpol'skil's effect. Several experiments showed that undecomposed BP could still be detected after 35 to 40 days to the extent of 5 to 20% of the Initial concentration. At the concentration of 10 µg/1 BP, only 10 to 15% of the BP was destroyed in the first few days. However, they found that at an initial concentration of 0.01 µg/l, almost 50% of the BP was destroyed in 24 hr. They also found that the decomposition took place note rapidly in 0.02 N potassium permanganate than in pure tap water. and in acid solution (pH 2.7) faster than in alkaline (pH 11.6) and neutral solutions (pH 6.7).

In other experiments, photooxidation was found to destroy 56% of the BP (present at an initial concentration of 0.1 g/l) in one day. In the dark, the degradation was negligible. With the addition of sodium suifite, the decomposition of BP was increased to 75% in both the presence and absence of light.

In general, studies have shown that the higher the temperature, oxygen concentration, and light intensity, the faster the rate of BP decomposition.

The greatest problems encountered in the analysis of PAH are their low concentrations and the separation of PAH from other organics as well as from each other. Preliminary techniques of extraction and concentration with solvents such as benzene, pentage, a-heptane, a-hexane, and a-

can be sources of error because even the purest of solvents contains traces of PAII. Fedomin et al. 10 noted that these traces may affect the ultimate analytical results because these preparatory techniques of separation and concentration involve the use of large amounts of solvents which, when evaporated, could contain considerable amounts of PAH. It is, therefore, imperative that a blank correction be made in procedures using large amounts of even chemically pure solvents.

Column, liquid, paper, and thin-layer chromatography are the most frequently used methods for the separation of PAH, followed by quantitative analysis using ultraviolet-visible absorption spectraand fluorescence spectra. Several studies that demonstrate the methodology for the examination of a wide variety of water and wastewater samples will be mentioned in the following paragraphs.

Paper chromatography of a mixture of PAli has been discussed, in which the minimum detectable amount on a chromatogram was 0.026 µg BP, 0.022 µg 20-methyl-cholanthrene, and 0.062 µg BA.¹⁴ Schloz and Altmann¹² detected 10⁻⁹ to 10⁻¹³ g/mi of BP in water by fluorescence spectroscopy, after a tenfold enrichment by extraction with cyclohexane, a 100-fold enrichment by evaporation of the extract, and a subsequent separation by thin-layer chromatography.

. Borneff' described a method to be used toutinely for the examination of PAII in drinking water and ground water to assess the efficiency of . a surface water purification plant. The World flealth Organization⁴ recommends this procedure for the determination of six PAil in drinking water to assess the presence of carcinogenic PAH in drinking water. Another method is described by Jaeger and Kassowitzova¹⁴ that can detect BP in drinking water at a concentration as low as 0.003 112/1. Siddigi and Wagner 1 describe a method for the determination of BP and 3,4-BF in rain water, ground water, and wheat using extraction with benzene, saponification with 2 N KOII, separation by either column or thin-layer chromatography, detection with ultraviolet light, and photometric determination.

The determination of PAH in polluted surface waters can be particularly difficult because of the presence of large quantities of organic compounds and the very low concentrations of PAH. Samples from the Charles River Basin (Boston, Massachusetts) were analyzed for PAH and other

ompounds using computerized gas chroby, mass spectrometry, and high pressure romatography. 16 Keegan 17 describes a developed for the determination of PAH irts per trillion range and utilized for rèrs in Connecticut.

'rial effluents are one of the major sources contamination of surface waters. Ershova is detected and quantitatively deter-A in petrochemical effluents by a variant spectroscopic-fluorescence method. A is described for the determination of a of several PAII in wastewaters using r chromatography on alumina and low lure spectral luminescent analysis. 19 il and Thiella20 used gas chromatoto do simultaneous qualitative and quantialysis of aromatic hydrocarbons, including d phenols in industrial wastewaters.

GIN, SOURCE, AND VEHICLES OF TRANSMISSION OF PAH

the purposes of the following discussion, m "origin" will refer to the formation of nd the term "source" will refer to the or material in which PAH can concentrate m which they can be disseminated to the ment. Industrial effluents, domestic efprecipitation, atmospheric fallout, and water are the vehicles of transmission of

and Source of PAII. pite their low solubility and stability in PAH are nevertheless ubiquitous in the ment. To understand this, it is necessary to

: the origin of PAH. istrial operations engaged in the pyrolytic ing of organic raw materials, such as coat

out at high temperatures (e.g., 700°C), as ed to the formation of paraffins, cycloparolefins, and phenois at lower temperatures o 450°C). The consumption of these ic products (coal tar, coal tar pitch, e) can also produce PAH.

troleum, form PAH when the process is

e of the industrial operations that produce e the preparation of acetylene from natural the pyrolysis of kerosene to benzene. and other organic solvents, 23 .the pyrowood.24 manufacture of electrolytic aluminum using graphite electrodes, 11 coke production,25 gas production from petroleum,26 the production of synthetic alcohol. 36 and oil. refinery operations. 27-36

The combustion of fuels by automobiles, airplanes, and boats involves the production of PAIL The source of PAII in the Charles River (Boston, Massachusetts) was thought to be automobile exhaust condensate washed from the streets directly into the river by rainfall. 4 Studies of soil, snow, and vegetation samples taken in the vicinity of a Moscow airport have been shown to contain large quantities of PAIL.31 Significantly larger amounts of BP were found in a Moscow reservoir with high boat traffic than a similar reservoir with low boat traffic. 11 Carbon black, used in the manufacturing of automobile tires, contains PAH and consequently the wear of tires on the road can be sources of PAII. Asphalt used in road construction contains PAII that could also be a source of contamination.

The presence of PAH in remote, nonindustrialized areas raises the question of the endogenous formation of PAH by plants and microorganisms. Borneff et al.,33 using the technique of labeled carbon assimilation, conclusively demonstrated that PAH can be synthesized by plants. Dacteria and phytoplankton are also capable of producing PAH. The appearance of BP in in vitro cultures of three strains of marine phytoplankton was corollary to the appearance of a mixture of aerobic bacteria. The addition of antibiotics to inhibit bacterial growth also prevented the formation of BP.34 Forest soils sterilized at 120°C and 170°C and seeded with either Clostridium putride or Escherichia coli contained significantly larger amounts of BP after standing at room temperature for six months. 35 The possibility that bacteria are capable of synthesizing BP is supported by the fact that compounds similar to BP have been found in the intestinal region of many animals where various types of bacteria are also found. Hydrocatbons of the BP type are found in all organs, particularly the liver, kidneys, spicen, and lungs. 26

The Clipperton Atoli Lazoon in the northeast Pacific Ocean is not located near any source of BP, yet its waters were shown to contain 3.5 to 4.0 με/l of BP.37 However, its water is rich in phytoplankton and marine bacteria, which seems to confirm the possibility of the biosynthesis of BP in a marine environment.38

Finally, it should be noted that, although no

PAll have been isolated from uncracked crude oil, the possibility exists that they contain traces that could be sources of PAH to environmental waters. The fact that large quantities of such oil are present in marine waters (it is estimated that one million metric tons are lost in the ocean during transport alone) and can accumulate in various marine organisms suggests that more research be done on this potential source of PAIL 39.40

Vehicles of Transmission of PAII

Industrial effluents carry PAII into receiving waters and existing methods of treatment generally do not reduce their PAH content. Effluents from industries engaged in the thermal processing of mineral fuels are one of the largest sources of PAH contamination of surface waters. Most of the quantitative studies of PAH in industrial effluents have been done by Soviet authors. Ershova and Mints 18,26 found BP and BA in effluents from industries engaged in the production of gas from petroleum and in the production of synthetic

alcohol. Samoilovich and Red'kin28 investigated effluents from oil refineries and concluded that they were the source of BP pollution of the Sunzha River. Ershova 10 detected BP in effluents from several oil refineries along the Volga River. River samples taken below the refineries and a sand sample from the filter of a waterworks located downstream all contained BP. The results point to the refinery effluents as the sources of the BP contamination. The amounts of PAII found in typical effluents are summarized in Table 1.

Since municipal wastes often contain large amounts of industrial effluents, they can transport PAII into surface waters. Run-off water passing over roads, plants, and soils carries PAH into the sewage system. In addition, human urine has been shown to contain BP.1 Table 2 lists some concentrations of PAH found in domestic wastes.

The amount of BP emitted annually into the atmosphere of a large industrial city has been estimated to be 30 to 40 kg.39 Substances polluting the air are eventually deposited by

TABLE ! PAH Concentration in Industrial Effluents

Industry	Source of trails water	BP concentration (#E/I)
Shale-oll	After treatment for dephenolization	2-320
Coke by-products	Not indicated After biochemical treatment After oil separation (5 samples)	Present 12–16 6.5, 130, 250, 290, and "big"
	Spent gas liquor	quantity Very small quantity
Cake or oliges works	Before discharge to sewer Before discharge to sewer (2 plants)	Not indicated* 8,000 and 340*
Oil-gas works	After oil separation (3 samples)	3, 6, and 30
Oli refinery	After oil separation (3 samples)	None detected
Ter paper	Not Indicated	fresent
Acetylene	Not indicated	15–100
Ammonium sulfete	After cooling and settling	About 10°
*Other PAH also pres	Hat	•

TABLE 2 PAH Concentration in Domestic Efficents

Concen	سمانحده	

Total PAN 15.9
15.0
••••
0.5
2.7
6.6
5.1
0.8
15.0
1.6
•
0.8
4.2
87.5
68.0
•
25.2
23.4 22.6 i
37-01
-
••
-
7 1
•
=

[&]quot;Taken from Andelman and Suess."

ral precipitation or fallout directly into surwaters or onto plants and soil where they can arried by run-off into surface waters. Due to ndogenous formation of PAH, a "backround" of PAH is present in most soils. After an. isive study of soil samples in remote areas of ia, Shabad et al.39 concluded that BP concenand of 5 to 10 µg/kg of soil are not unnatural i associated with exogenous contamination.

while concentrations of I to 2 µg/kg are typically backround levels. The same authors found as much as 220,000 µg of BP/kg of soil in the vicinity of an oil refinery. Shcherbak23 found that vegetation samples taken within 300 m of the "neftegaz" plant in Moscow contained BP in concentrations varying from 0.6 to 5.9 µg/kg of dried material. and that most soil samples taken 3,000 m from the plant still contained quantities of BP higher than

the general backround level for the city of Moscow. Studies have also shown that PAII can be concentrated in deeper soil layers and hence also contaminate the ground water.25

PAll have also been found in snow samples taken in the vicinity of a Moscow airport.31 on the grounds of a timber-chemical plant, 24 and in various areas of a large industrial city (Moscow).41 Siddigl and Wagner s also found levels as high as 0.3 μ g/I of BP and 3.1 μ g/I of 3.4-BF in rain water.

PAH IN **ENVIRONMENTAL WATERS**.

For the purpose of this review, environmental waters will be divided into four different categories: 1) marine waters, 2) surface waters, including flora, fauna, and sediments, 3) ground water, and 4) drinking water.

The most extensive studies of PAII in the marine environment have been done by Mallet and his co-workers. They made systematic studies of the Atlantic, Ghannel, and Mediterranean coasts of France, the Bay of Naples, Italy, and the western coast of Greenland. BP was found to be present in almost all samples of plankton, algae, fauna, and sediments in the areas studied. Even the remote areas off the coast of Greenland contained on the average the same concentrations of BP as areas along the French coast, thus indicating the ubiquity of BP in the marine environment. The results of Maliet's studies are summarized by Andelman and Suess.³

As noted previously, large amounts of crude oil are lost to the ocean each year. The possibility that marine organisms can concentrate and fix hydrocarbons could account for their presence in some marine organisms. Lee et al.42 analyzed several fish, including anchovies and smelt, from the oil polluted San Diego Bay and found BP in amounts as high as 10 µg per fish, as well as lesser amounts of other PAH (average dry weight of each fish varied from 2 to 10 g). Lee et al.43 also observed that the marine mussel Mytilus edulis rapidly took up BP from seawater solutions and retained significant amounts even after being placed in clean seawater. Blumer. 40 while studying the long-term effects of an oil spill in Buzzards Bay, Massachusetts, found toxic aromatic hydrocarbons still present in edible shellfish 2 months after the oil spill. Fish (Carassius auratus) feeding

food (laining BP were found to metabolize

and eliminate BP very slowly with residues left in the liver, gonads, and muscles of the fish more than 2 days after the administration of BP was halted.44

The presence of BP in the tidal mud of Sain Malo Bay was investigated by Mallet et al.45 and found to vary seasonally in BP content due to the action of anaerobic bacteria which synthesize BP and the aerobic bacteria which degrade BP. The presence of BP in the waters of Clipperton Atoli-Lagoon was also thought to be due to the combined action of anaeroble and aerobic bacteria.37 BP found in Atlantic phytoplankton in the Greenland to Gascony Gulf areas was thought to be synthesized from the lipids of plankton by bacteria.46 The source of most of the PAH in the marine environment is probably due to endogenous sources rather than to exogenous sources, such as surface waters from highly polluted areas.

Other studies have revealed the presence of BP in wide zones of the Adriatic but only during the estival season.47,48 Studies conducted by Greffard and Meury 49 in the Toulon Harbor showed PAH concentrations varying between 9.0 and 284 µg/100 g of dried stime, and BP concentrations varying from 3.0 to 4.0 µg/100 g dry weight in washed mussels.

Considerable quantities of PAH can be carried into surface waters by domestic sewage, industrial effluents, and storm water run-off from roads and contaminated land. The maximum amount determined in any of these sources has been 134 µg/l. 50 The presence of PAH in areas remote from any exogenous sources also confirms a natural level of PAll in surface waters. Il'nitskii et al. 11 concluded that this level did not exceed 10-5 to 10-4 µg/l of BP for surface waters, 1 to 2 µg/kg of BP for bottom sand, and 5 µg of BP per kilogram of dry matter for algae and higher plants. Levels in excess of these amounts can be taken as indications of environmental pollution by man.

flighly polluted waters are conducive to the preservation of PAH in surface waters. The Sunzha River in the U.S.S.R. is heavily polluted with detergents, benzene, ether, and oils, their concentrations ranging from,96 to 350 mg/l. As would be expected, investigations carried out by Samollovich and Red'kin28 showed high BP concentrations at great distances downstream from industrial outfalls (0.07 to 1.06 µg/l at a point 25 km downstream from the lowest outfall).

Laboratory experiments conducted by Suess, 53

7 conditions similar to the Ohio River

sburgh, Pennsylvania), showed that BP degra-1 in natural waters depends on solar illumina-, temperature, and dissolved oxygen entrations. In polluted waters with high idity. BP would degrade very little in suspendiolids and probably not at all in bottom nents. BP degradation in surface waters is also ed to flow velocity and surface area. dilovich and Red'kin28 found that the higher flow velocity and the greater the surface area, faster the degradation of BP.

All concentrations in the surface water conment are very high, essentially due to genous pollution. Typical concentration ranges summarized in Table 3 and the results of some nt studies are summarized in Tables 4 and 5. acontaminated ground waters show the est concentrations of PAH of all natural ers. Concentrations will generally not exceed 5 µg/l.13 Siddigi and Wagner15 reported find-0.01 to 0.03 µg/l of BP and 0.08 to 0.6 µg/l of BF in ground water samples.

Borneff and Kunte 13 noted that concentrations to 0.10 µg/l of PAH are found in drinking er. They concluded that values between 0.15 0.20 µg/1 demand an examination of the water itment facilities, and water containing PAH In ess of 0.20 uell should be rejected for human sumption. The World Health Organization ropean Standards for Drinking Water,* adopted 1970, also states that concentrations of PAH in

excess of this amount are not sale for human consumption. Studies summarized by Andelman and Suess show that, in general, the total carcinogenic PAH in drinking water do not exceed 0.025 µg/L

EFFECT OF WATER AND WASTEWATER TREATMENT ON PAH

Since considerable portions of the PAII present in untreated waters are associated with particles, separation processes such as sedimentation and filtration with sand or activated carbon can be very effective in reducing PAH concentrations. The highest removal (98.5%), reported by Borneff, 4 was accomplished in a flocculation plant, which used as a primary step ferrous sulfate and chlorine, followed by ozone and ferric chloride, and then sand filtration. The purified water had a PAII content similar to ground water. Reichert et al. 5 found that primary and secondary sedimentation of sewage reduced the PAH by 80 to 90%. Further treatment with synthetic flocculants, followed by filtration through activated carbon, yields a water with PAH concentration similar to ground water. Lawerenz¹⁶ found that treatment of water from the Elbe River in flocculation tanks was effective in reducing PAH concentrations.

Mechanical separation processes will have very little effect on dissolved PAH. li'nitskil⁵⁷ conducted experiments using BP concentrations in the

TABLE 3 Typical Concentration Ranges of BP and PAII in Various Fresh Surface Waters

Concent	tret	ion	(vg/	Ų
_		.		

Source	BP	Cucinogenio / PAH	Total PAH	Reference
Rhine River at verious points	0.03-0.11	0.01-0.73	0.73~1.50	Andelman and Spess
Various Germala	0.001-0.04	0.04-1.30	0.12-3.1	Andelmen and Suess ¹
One American	0.078-0.150	-	~	Koogan ^{t 7}
Rivers teceiv- ing effluents from indus- tries that are sources	0.0001-12	•	,	Andelman and Suest, ⁵ Esshova, ⁶⁰ and Samollovich and Red'kin ⁶⁰
of PAH .	1	į.	••	•

RC Critical Reviews in Embr

TABLE 4

•	stration of BP in	lace Waters
Source	BP concentration	•
Source	PE/I	Reference
Moscow reservoirs, slightly polluted	4-13	li'nitskii and Rechkova**
Volga River below dis- charge site of oil refinery	0.0001	Esshova**
Pskov region, remote from exogenous sources of BP	10-4-10-4	B'nitskii et al.º 6
Sunzha River, 3-4 km downstream from dis- charge sites of pet- toleum refinery (23 samples)	, 0.05-3.5	Samollovich and Red'kin' •
Sunzius River, 25 km downstream from lowest discharge site of pot- toleum refinery	0.07-1.06	Samollovich and Red' <u>kin</u> **
Oyster River, Conn., U.S.		Keegan ^{1 †}
Sample 1	0.078	-
Sample 2 .	0.125	• • =
Sample 3	0.150	- •
•		

TABLE 5

patistics of BP in Surface Water Eqvironment

	BP concentration PE/kg	•
Source	dry material	Reference
Rubievskoye Reserveir		' If'nitskil et al. **
Plankton ·	0.7-1.8	(
Bottom sand	44	-
Fond weeds	0.6-2.7	
Khimkinskoe Reservoir		H'nitskij et al.ºº
Plankton	• 7.3~8.8	or current of Et.
Bottom sand	390~500	. =
Fond weeds	1.7~37.8	-
	1./~3/.5	-
Bottom sediments of Sunzha River, 3-4 km	9.2-19.0	. SamoSovich and Red'kin'
downstream from dis- charge site of refinery		·.
Bottom sediments of Sunzha River 25 km	trace-3.1	SemeSovich and Red'kin ¹⁰
downstream from dis-	•	•
charge site of refinery	•	
Silt in Moscow Reservoir	1.0-5.0	Il'nitskii and Rozhkova ¹³
l l		a mount and Morntols.
říkov region, remoto	•	Enhants
from exogenous sources of BP	٠,	
Algae		•
Da44 4	•	•

Efficiency of Various Combinations of Water Trea at It is to Eliminate Low Concentrations of BP^a

Process	Number of experiments	Initial BP concentration, x 10 ⁻⁸ g/ml	Efficiency, S
Standing (precipitation)	• .	1.7	54 ± 16
Flocculation +	4	3.5 1.6	56 ± 9 . 69
Flocculation + filtration in pilot-plant	, i	1.8	89 ± 3
installation	•		•

^{*}Taken from Il'nitskil."

that they are usually found under natural ions to test the efficacy of mechanical tion processes. He found that the techniques igated reached their practical limit at low nations since the techniques were designed nove suspended, not dissolved, matter. This as results summarized in Table 6 which show the same effectiveness for simple standing flocculation followed by standing.

logical treatment is very ineffective in reig any PAII from contaminated waters. A ing study, conducted by Malaney et al.,58 d that activated sludge treatment of stic sewage from Nashville, Tennessee, was to effect any significant removal of PAH by xidative mechanism within normal detention Any reduction of PAH in the sewage was to adsorption by the activated sludge. va²⁶ found that effluents from a petroical plant still contained up to 1.7 μ g/l of BP).6 μ g/l of BA even after being subjected to remical purification in seration tanks. kii et al. 27 also found that biochemical ent, steam dephenolization, and extraction butylacetone do not achieve the complete valion of PAH in effluents.

vation of PAIS in elliuents.

e contamination of surface and grounds with PAII and compounds that may soluPAII makes it necessary to investigate ods for the elimination of dissolved PAH potable waters. Since mechanical methods of able to remove dissolved PAH, oxidation is faily important. Studies on the efficacy of the control of treatment with CIO2 have been carried.

out by H'nitskii, Ershova, Shabad, Reichert, Gabovich, and their associates (References 7, 27, 57, and 59 to 66). Their results indicate that ozonation is the most effective treatment for the reduction of PAII in water, followed by treatment with ClO₂. The other processes studied were for the most part ineffective in significantly reducing PAII concentrations using normal rates of application and detention times. The efficacy of ozone may be reduced by the presence of other organic compounds. BP was found to be the most resistant of the PAII to treatment. Some test results are summarized in Tables 7 and 8.

Since BP can be present in water in either a dissolved state or sorbed onto particles, Il'nitskii et al.²⁷ carried out experiments using BP sorbed onto soil particles. The results indicate that the BP sorbed onto soil particles are more stable than dissolved BP. One minute's contact with ozone inactivated 61% of the dissolved BP but only 33% of the sorbed BP; 2½ min contact destroyed all the dissolved BP but only 60% of the sorbed BP.

In order to deliver drinking water to consumers with the lowest possible concentration of PAH, Borneff⁵⁴ recommends the use of flocculation, ozonation, filtration, and adsorption on activated charcoal for raw waters containing 0.1 to 1.0 µg/l of PAH; and that raw waters containing over 1.0 µg/l of PAH never be used even after purification. Il'nitskil⁸⁷ concluded that by using ozone rather than chlorine and UV irradiation, a 100-fold greater reduction of BP could be accomplished. For dissolved BP and other PAH, ozonation is necessary to deliver water practically free of carcinogenic hydrocarbons to consumers.

mitration of Hydrocarbons After One Minute of Contact with Ozone⁸

llydrocarbon	Mean Repidual, S		
3,4-Benzpyrene (BP) Pyrene (PY) 1,2-Benzanthracene (BA) 1,2,5,6-Dibenzanthracene (DBA) 9,10-Dimethyl-1,2-Benzanthracene (DMBA)		39 15 4.5 3.6	•
Taken from li'nitskii et al. *		•	

TABLE &

Comparetive Stabilities of Cuitale Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons to UV Radiation and Ozone^a

		Concentration of undecomposed hydrocarbon (%) after	
	Hydrocarbon	UV tradiation for 60 min	Ozonization for 1 min
	3,4-Benzypyrene (BP)	95	. 39 .
ļ	Pyrene (PY)	83	15
	1,2,5,6-Dibenzanthracene (DBA)	83	3.6
	Perylene	81	-
	1,2-Benzanthracene (BA)	68	4.5
	1,12-Benzperylene	45	-
	9,10-Dimethyl-1,2-benzanthracene (DMBA)	, 11	•

Taken from Il'nitskii et al.

Waters distributed to consumers are usually used for the preparation of food. Studies carried out by Il'nitskii et al. showed that the boiling of water containing 0.0002 to 0.002 µg/l of BP for 60 min destroyed most of the carcinogen. The results of this experiment are shown in Table 9.

HEALTH CONSIDERATIONS OF PAH IN THE WATER ENVIRONMENT

There is no epidemiological evidence to prove that PAH in drinking water are related to the incidence of cancer. Also, as stated by il'nitskil and Shabad,² the amount of carcinogenic PAH consumed by man in water is typically only 0.1% of the amount he consumes from food. Nevertheless, accumulation of PAH in edible squatic organisms can greatly increase this amount.²,⁴ 2-4

TABLE

Effect of 60 Minutes' Soiling on BP Dissolved in Water at Various pH Levely®

	•	BP concentration, µg/l		
pH of	Number of			
Water	experiments	Init ia)	After boiling	
2.7	4	0.001	0, 0, 0, 0.0002	
3.0	3	0.0002	0. 0. 0	
6.3	4	0.002	0, 0, 0.0002, 0.0002	
0.11	4 .	0.002	0, 0, 0.00095, 0.0002	

*Taken from If'nitskii et al."

The use of contaminated water for irrigation can also spread PAH into other foodstuffs.²

Shabad³ urges that everything possible be done to establish maximum permissible doses (MPD) and maximum permissible concentrations (MPC)

individual carcinogens, with first priority being n to the PAII, most notably BP. He reported one such effort based on the intragastric inistration of a gradually diminishing series of i of BP and observing whether or not cancer induced. These experiments were used to blish doses which did not produce cancer. On basis of these data and taking into account the erences in body weight and organ surface areas rats and humans, they calculated that the MPC BP in water should not exceed 0.0003 µg/1, ch for all practical purposes is zero. Even igh this type of approach may be controversial far from perfect, Shabad emphasizes the need more experiments in this direction, including transplacental influence on succeeding genera-

Andelman and Suess¹ discussed another conpart of MPC in water in which it was suggested it the amount of carcinogens taken up by man drinking water should not exceed 1/10 of the lerial taken up from normal urban air. Using is concept the MPC for water would be 0.017. I. Based on an average daily consumption of 2.5. I drinking water, this comes out to 15 µg/year I about 1 mg in a lifetime. The 1970 World with Organization European Standards for inking Water⁴ recommends a concentration of

If not exceeding 0.2 µg/l.

Andelman and Suess¹ made calculations based four samples of drinking water to determine an nual human consumption of PAH to be about 6, 22, and 70 µg for the populations served by we water supplies.

Drinking water is not the only source of PAH

humans. They are also found in smoked and isted foods, in vegetables, and plant fats and is, as well as being breathed in from the mosphere. Borneff^{6,7} warns that human exture to PAH from all these sources could result a yearly uptake of carcinogens at levels which use carcinoma in animal experiments. The mount of carcinogenic PAH consumed from

finking water is probably not dangerous. Never-

theless, in combination with other sources it cannot be excluded as a possible hazard, especially since animal experiments indicate that repeated exposure to carcinogens is more effective in producing cancer than an equivalent single dose.

CONCLUSIONS

The following conclusions can be drawn from reviewing the literature:

- 1. The significance of traces of PAH in drinking water to human health is not yet known.
- 2. BP and other PAH are very insoluble in water but can be solubilized by detergents, oils, and other organic compounds. In most cases, however, the concentrations of detergents are not high enough to affect PAH solubilities.
- 3. BP can be very stable in water and is one of the most carcinogenic of the PAII.
- With the present emphasis on water pollution control, attention should be given to reducing the amounts of carcinogenic PAH discharged to surface waters.
- 5. Concentrations of PAH in uncontaminated ground waters generally do not exceed 0.05 µg/l. Higher concentrations are found in surface and marine waters. Efforts should be made to determine the sources of the contamination of waters, especially when they may serve as sources of drinking water.
- 6. Mechanical separation processes, biological treatment, UV irradiation, and chlorination are not successful in removing enough carcinogenic PAH from drinking water. Ozonation and ClO₂ appear to be the most promising methods of effectively destroying PAH in drinking water.
- 7. The generally higher concentrations of PAH in polluted waters suggest that these compounds may have utility as indicators of pollution.
- 8. It would be prudent to establish MPD and MPC for PAH in drinking water.

REFERENCES

- 1. Andelman, J. B. and Suess, M. J., Polymuclear aromatic hydrocarbons in the water environment, Bull. W.H.O. 479, 1970.
- Shabad, L. M. and ll'nitakil, A. P., Perspective on the problem of carcinogenic pollution in water bodies, Gig. S. 35(8), 84, 1970 (Russian); (Eng. Iransl., Hyg. Sanit., 35, 268, 1970).
- Shabad, L. M., Concerning the possibility of establishing maximum permissible doses and concentrations (MPD: MPCs) for carcinogens, Ilyg. Sanit., 36(10), 115, 1971.
- 4. World Health Organization, European Standards for Drinking Water, 2nd ed., Revised, Geneva, 1970.
- Ducument No. 12: The National Institute of Environmental Health Sciences Task Force Advocates a Drinking V Program (1970). Safe 'Drinking Water Hearings, U.S. Congressional Subcommittee on Public Health Environment, May 1971, Serial No. 92-94, p. 634.
- il'nitskii, A. P. and Ershova, K. P., Factors influencing the solubility of benzo(a)pyrene in water, Fops. On 16(8), 86, 1970 (Russian); C. A., 1971, 74, 79382k.
- Il'aliskii, A. P., Ershova, K. P., Khesina, A. Y., Rozhkova, L. G., Klubkov, V. G., and Korolev, A. A., Stabiliticarcinogens in water and various methods of decontamination, Gig. Santi., 36(4), 8, 1971 (Russian); (Eng. tra H)z. Santi., 36, 9, 1971).
- Eisenbrand, J. and Baumann, K., Water-solubility of 3,4-benzopyrens and formation of a water-soluble com with caffeine, Z. Lebensm.-Unters.-Forsch., 140(3), 158, 1969 (German); C.A., 1969, 71, 95518c.
- Jarger, J. and Kassowitzova, B., Breakdown of 3,4-benzopyrene in water, Cerk. Hyg., 13(5), 288, 1968 (Czeck. A., 1968, 69, 69550w.
 Fedonin, V. F., Gri'dis, V. Y., Malinovskaya, M. N., and Medvedev, A. M., 3,4-Benzpyrene concentration
- organic solvents and an improved method for determination of carcinogens, Hyg. Sanit., 35(4), 92, 1970.

 Malakhina, A. Y., Til'kov, M. I., and Shaposhnikov, Y. K., Paper chromatography of polynuclear aron
- hydrocarbons, *Hrg. Sanit.*, 36(1), 97, 1971.

 12. Schloz, L. and Allmann, H. J., Determination of 3,4-benzopyrene in water, *Fresentus' Z. Anal. Chem.*, 240(2) 1968 (German); C. A., 1968, 69, 79994h.
- Bornell, J. and Kunte, H., Carcinogenic substances in water and soil. A toutine method for the determination polynuclear asomatic hydrocarbons in water, Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol., 153(3), 220, 1969 (German); C. A., 1969, 73890r.
- Jaeger, J. and Kassowitzova, B., Determination of 3,4-benzopyrens in drinking water, Chem. Listy, 62(2), 1968 (Czech.); C. A., 1968, 68, 72118w.
- Siddiqi, I. and Wagner, K. H., Determination of 3,4-benzpyrene and 3,4-benzofluoranthene in rain water, growater and wheat, Chemosphere, 1(2), 83, 1972 (German); C. A., 1972, 77, 57226x.
- Ilites, R. A. and Blemann, K., Water pollution: Organic compounds in the Charles River, Boston. Science, 178, 1972.
- Kergan, R. E., The trace fluorometric determination of polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbons in natural with Doctoral dissertation, Graduato School of Chemistry, University of New Hampshire, Durham, New Hampshire, 19
 Ershova, K. P. and Mints, I. M., Determination of 1,2-benzanthracene in petrochemical effluents, Gig. Sanit., 33
- 52, 1968 (Russian); (Eng. transf., Hrg. Sanit., 33, 371, 1968).
 8tepanova, M., Il'ina, R. I., and Shaposhnikov, Y. K., Determination of polynuclear aromatic hydrocarbon chemical and petrochemical wastewater, Zh. Anal. Khim., 27(6), 1201, 1972 (Russian); C. A., 1972, 77, 1053.
 Chicardoni M. and Thinh. G. Guinter.
- 28. Ghirardoni, M. and Thirila, C., Simultaneous qualitative and quantitative determination of aromatic hydrocart and phenois in industrial wastewaters, Boll. Lab. Chim. Prov., 22(6), 1024, 1071 (Italian); C. A., 1972, 77, 660
- Vodyanik, R. S., Gubernatorova, V. A., and Livke, V. A., Controlling the quality of the purification of wastewa from acetylene production, Khim. Prom. Ukr., 3, 44, 1970 (Russian); C. A., 1970, 73, 112716b.
 Livke, V. A. and Vodyanik, R. S., Removal of condensed aromatic hydrocarbons from wastewaters from
- preparation of acetylene, Khim. Prom. (Moscow), 45(1), 30, 1969 (Russian); C. A., 1969, 70, 86677).
- Sheherbak, N. P., Effect of discharges from oll processing plants on pollution of soil vegetation by 3,4-benzoñye. Ilyz. Sanit., 33(7), 109, 1968.
 Skwortsova, N. N. and Kimina, S. N., Atmospheric pollution by 3,4-benzpyrene in the vicinity of a timber-chem.
- plant, Hyg. Sanit., 33(2), 159, 1968.

 Sukhoteplyi, I. N., Shelyug, M. Y., Kalinichenko, G. S., and Drozdova, T. V., Poliution of soil in an industrial
- by 3.4-benzpyrene, Hyg. Sanit., 33(11), 294, 1968.

 24. Ferbara V. P. Studies of the contest of actionals budges by 1.4-benzpyrene, Hyg. Sanit., 32(11), 294, 1968.
- Ershova, K. P., Studies of the content of polycyclic hydrocarbons in effluents of petrochemical industry and survaters, Hyg. Sanit., 16(6), 474, 1971.
 Waltskii, A. P., Khesina, A. Y., Cherkinskii, S. N., and Shabad, L. M., Effects of ozonation upon aron
- hydrocarbons, including carcinogens, Gig. Sanit., 33(3), 8, 1968 (Russian); (Eng. transl., Hyg. Sanit., 33, 32), 15
 8 Samollovich, L. N. and Red'kin, Y. R., 3,4-Benzopyrene poliution of the River Sunsha caused by the petrochem industry in Grozny, Gig. Sanit., 33(11), 6, 1968 (Russian); (Eng. transl., Hyg. Sanit., 165).
- 29. Shabad, L. M., Cohan, Y. L., Il'nitskii, A. P., Khetina, A. Y., Shcharbak, N. P., and Smirnov, G. A., The care hydrocarbon beams(a)py in the soil, J. Netl. Cancer Inst., 47, 1179, 1971.

- rshova, K. P., Carcinogenic pollution of water by effluents from petroleum refineries, Gig. Santt., 33(2), 102, 1968 Russiant; (Eng. transl., 11)g. Sanit., 33, 286, 1968). habad, L. M. and Smirnov, G. A., Aircraft engines as a source of carcinogenic pollution of the environment
- benzota)pyrene studies). Atmos. Environ... 6, 153, 1972. l'nitskii, A. P., Kluhkov, V. G., and Shabad, L. M., Navigation as one of the sources of poliution of water reservoirs
- y carcinogenic hydrocarbons, 1'ope. Onkol., 18(1), 49, 1972 (Russian); C. A., 1972, 76, 89789d.
- forneff. J., Selenka, F., Kunte, H., and Maximos, A., Experimental studies on the formation of polycyclic aromatic
- rdrocarbons in plants, Environ. Res. 2, 22, 1968. aussat, P., Stallet, L., and Ottenwaelder, J., Presence of benzo(a)pyrene in various marine phytoplankton species
- altivated in vitto, C. R. Acad. Sci. (Paris), Ser. D. 268(7), 1109, 1969 (French); C. A., 1969, 70, 112540c. Isliet, L. and Tissier, M., Biosynthesis of polycyclic hydrocarbons of the benzo(a)pyrene type in forest soil. C.R.
- xc. Biol. [faris], 163(1), 63, 1969 (French); C. A., 1970, 73, 443011. of, F., Bacterial synthesis of carcinogenic hydrocarbons, Sct. Progr. Decouverte, 3416, 491, 1969 (French); G.A.,
- 970, 72, 75941c. Vallet, L., Bacterial biosynthesis of polycyclic hydrocarbom of the benzo (a) pyrene type in biological media, Gas.
- Hop. Civ. Mil., 143(19), 605, 1971; C.A., 1972, 76, 2510j. Visusset, P., Ehrhardt, J., and Ottenwalder, J., Presence of 3,4-bentopyrene in the Clipporton Atoli Ingoon, C. R.
- Acad. Sci. (Paris), 267(21), 1772, 1968 (French); C.A., 1969, 70, 4056lk.
- Blumer, M., Oil pollution of the ocean, Occanus, 15(2), 2, 1969. Blumer, M., Souza, G., and Sass. J., Hydrocarbon pollution of edible shallfish by an oil spill, *Her. Biol.*, 5, 195,
- Gurgy, F. J. and Novikov, Y. V., Fluorimetric spectrography of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in snow and soli samples, Glg. Sanit., 36(3), 71, 1971 (Russian); (Eng. transl., Ilvg. Sanit., 36, 409, 1971).
- Lee, R. F., Sauerheber, R., and Dobbs, G. II., Uptake, metabolism and discharge of polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons by marine fish, *Mar. Biol.*, 17, 201, 1972, Lee, R. F., Sauerheber, R., and Benson, A. A.,Petroleum hydrocarbons: Uptake and discharge by the marine mussel Mytilus edulis, Science, 177, 344, 1972.
- raccini, A., Scaccini, C. M., Marani, F., and Leonardi, V., Dosing and observing by means of spectrophotolunrimetry and fluorescence microscopy 3,4-benzopyrene on the organs and tissues of Carassius auratus, .sca-Fano, 3(6), 105, 107, 1970(Italian); Poll. Abstr., 72-5tc-0429. 'allet, L., Priou, M. L., and Leon, M., Biosynthesis and reduction of the polycyclic hydrocarbon, 3,4-benzopyrene,
- Lima-Zanghi, C., Marine plankton faity solds and pollution with benzo (s) pyrene, Cah. Oceanogr., 20(3), 203, 968(French); C. A., 1968, 69, 45858b.

n the silt of the Saint Malo bay, C. R. Aced. Scl. (Paris), Ser. D, 268(1), 202, 1969(Feench); C. A., 1969, 70,

- mo. M. V. and Molines, M. P., Further observations on the presence of 3.4-benzopyrene in a wide zone of the Iriatic, Pexce Fano, 3(1), 1, 31, 1969(Italian); Poll. Abstr., 71-5TC-366. scatelli, S. M., The pollution of some areas of the Adriatic with 3,4-benzopyrene, Rev. Int. Oceanogr. Med., 24,
- B1, 1971((talian): Poll. Abstr., 72-4TC-0318. effard, J. and Meury, J., Carcinogenic hydrocarbon pollution in Toulon harbor, Cah. Oceanogr., 19(6), 457. 967(1 rench): C. A., 1968, 68, 24451c.
- weeff. J. and Kunte. H., Carcinogenic substances in water and soil. XIX. Effect of wastewater surlification on stycyclic, aromatic compounds, Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol., 151, 202, 1967 (German); C.A., 1968, 68, 6013g. initskil, A. F., Rozhnova, L. G., and Drozdova, T. V., On the content of carcinogenic hydrocarbons in surface
- aters, Hyg Sanit., 36(5), 316, 1971. pess, M. J., Laboratory experiments with 3,4-benzpyrene in aqueous systems and the environmental consequences,
- 31 Bckteriol , Hyg., 1 Abt. Orig. B, 155, \$41, 1972. initskii, A. P. and Rozhnova, L. G., Pollution of reservoirs by carc**inagenic hydrocarbons,** *Vopr. Onkol.,* **16(7), 78,** 970(Russian); C. A., 1970, 73, 123343d.
- princife, J., I limination of carcinogenic polycyclic aromatic compounds during water publication, Gas-Wasserfach, 10(2), 29, 1969(German); C. A., 1969, 70, 50347].
- richert, J., Kunte, H., Borneff, J., and Engelhardt, K., Carclinogenic substances occurring in water and soil. XXVII. urther studies on the elimination from waste of carcinogenic polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons, Zentreibl. :ktcriol [Noturwiss.]. 155(1), 18, 1971(German); C. A., 1971, 75, 154806c.
- awereng, A., Detection of carcinogenic substances in water purified by two different procuses, Z. Gesamte Hyp. 3(11), 844, 1967(German); C. A., 1969, 70, 22818v.
- Initskii, A. P. Experimental investigation of the elimination of carcinogenic hydrocarbons from water during its larsfication and disinfection. Gig. Sanit., 34(9), 26, 1969(Russian); (Eng. transl., Hyg. Sanit., 34, 317, 1969). alaney, G. W., Lutin, P. A., Cibulka, J. J., and Hickerson, L. H., Resistance of carcinogenic organic compounds to
- cidation by activated studge, J. Water Pollut. Control Fed., 39(12), 2020, 1968. povich, R. D., Vrochinskii, K. K., and Kurinnyi, I., Decolorization, decoderation and decontamination of inking water by exemization, Gir. Santt., 34(6), 18, 1969(Russian); (Eng. transl., Hyr. Santt., 34, 336, 1969).

- disinfection of water, Gig. Nasclennykh Mest. Resp. Mezhved. Sb., 8, 88, 1969(Russian); C. A., 1970, 73, 28613h Reichert, J. K., Carcinogens in water and soil. XXIV. Removal of polycyclic aromatic compounds in drinking water treatment with chlorine dioxide: identification of previously unknown products of the reaction of 3,4-benropyres. and chlusine dinxide, Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol., 152(3), 277, 1968 (German); C.A., 1968, 69, 89650s.
 - Reichert, J. K., Carcinogens in water and soil. XXIII. Removal of polycyclic atomatic compounds in the treatment of tap water with chlorine dioxide: Isolation and Identification of products of the reaction with 3,4-benzupy rene Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol., 152(3), 265, 1968(German); C. A., 1968, 69, 89651h. Reichert, J. K., Carcinogenic substances in water and soil. XXI. Quantitative results on the removal of polycycli-

Gaborich, R. D., Kurennoi, I. L., and Fedorcako, Z. P., Effect of ozone and chlorine on 3,4-benzopyrene during th

- aromatic compounds from drinking water by chlorine dioxide treatment, Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol. 152(1), 37, 1968(German); C. A., 1968, 69, 21827q. 64. Reichert, J. K., Elimination of carcinogenic aromatic polycytic compounds in drinking water treatment with special
 - . consideration of ozone, Gas Wasserfach, 110(18), 477, 1969(German); C. A., 1969, 71, 15893h. Reichert, J. K., Elimination of carcinogenic aromatic polycyclic compounds in drinking water treatment with special carcinogenicity of chlorinated 3,4-benzopyrenes, Arch. Hyg. Bakteriol., 153(1), 26, 1969(German); C. A., 1969, 74,
 - 37064r. Koroley, A. A., Ozonation as a method for the decontamination of water poliuted with chemical compounds, Gig Soult, 37(12), 78, 1972(Russian); C.A., 1972, 78, 88422h.
 - Borneff, J., Occurrence and evaluation of carcinogens in water, Gas-Wasserfech, 108(38), 1072, 1967(German); C A., 1968, 68, 62537L

- 27. Lijinsky, W. and P. Shubik, 1965, "Folynuclear Hydrocarbon Carcinogens in Cooked Meat and Smoked Food," Ind. Med. Surg., 34, 152-154.
- 28. Commoner, E., A. J. Vithayathil, P. Dolara, S. Nair, P. Madyastha and G. C. Cuca, 1978, "Formation of Mutagens in Beef and Beef Extract During Cooking," Science, 201, 913-916.
- 29. U. S. Department of Agriculture, Agriculture Research Service, 1968, "Food Consumption of Households in the North Central, Spring 1965," Household Food Consumption Survey 1965-1966 Report No. 3, U. S. Gov't. Printing Office.